DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 046 011 CG 006 068

AUTHOR White, Kinnard; Allen, Richard
TITLE Art Counseling in an Educational Setting: Self Concept Change Among Pre-Adolescent Boys.
INSTITUTION North Carolina Advancement School, Winston-Salem.; North Carolina Univ., Chapel Hill.
PUB DATE 69
NOTE 17p.

EDRS PRICE EDRS Price MF-$0.65 HC-$3.29
DESCRIPTORS *Art, *Counseling, Counseling Effectiveness, Counseling Services, Creativity, *Elementary School Counseling, Elementary School Counselors, Elementary School Students, Individual Development, *Nondirective Counseling, *Self Concept, Self Expression

ABSTRACT

This study was designed to test the hypotheses that (1) pre-adolescent boys show greater growth in positive self-concept when subjected to an art counseling program than when they receive a traditional non-directive counseling program having the same goal; and (2) this difference will continue to exist on into adolescence. Thirty boys who had just completed the sixth grade were subjects for the study. One group of fifteen boys received art counseling; the other group of fifteen boys received only traditional non-directive counseling. The art counseling group was unaware of the goals of art counseling and viewed each session as an art class they had elected. The treatment took place over a daily eight weeks summer session. A follow-up of both groups was conducted fourteen months later. A multivariate analysis of covariance with ten criteria--ten subscales on the "Tennessee Self-Concept Scale"--and ten covariates--pre-test scores on the subscales--was performed on the data. The results supported both hypotheses. (Author)

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
OFFICE OF EDUCATION
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL OFFICE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY.

ED 046011

ART COUNSELING IN AN EDUCATIONAL SETTING: SELF CONCEPT CHANGE AMONG PRE-ADOLESCENT BOYS

Kinnard White
University of North Carolina
Chapel Hill

Richard Allen
North Carolina Advancement School
Winston-Salem

Basic differences between counseling pre-adolescents and counseling adolescents and adults are beginning to be recognized (Dinkmeyer, 1966). The manner in which the pre-adolescent relates to adults in a one-to-one or group setting, the qualitatively different language that is used by the pre-adolescent and the position held by the pre-adolescent in the social system all raise basic questions as to the feasibility of the direct application of the theory and procedures of current counseling approaches to counseling programs for pre-adolescents in an elementary school setting (Aubrey, 1967).

Aubrey (1967) has further argued that certain conditions inherent in the structure of most school counseling programs such as the involuntary nature of much school counseling, the limitations of time, and the irregularity of counseling contacts also make it unlikely that current counseling models will result in success. There is, therefore, a need to investigate models that can be more realistically applied to both the practicalities of the school setting and the developmental level of the pre-adolescent.

CG 006 068

Although the use of art in therapy has gained rather wide acceptance in the hospital setting, especially with emotionally disturbed children, and in the private practice of psychoanalysists, the use of art to aid in the counseling of students with developmental and situational problems has not been systematically pursued.

Denny (1969) recently introduced the term art counseling and attempted to distinguish it from art therapy. The primary characteristics which Denny used to distinguish art counseling from art therapy were that art counseling is shorter in term, art counseling does not focus on unconscious expressions, and art counseling stresses the normal rather than the pathological. Such reconceptualizations appear to be necessary if new breakthroughs in the theory and practice of counseling are to be discovered (Thoresen, 1969). This reconceptualization of the use of art in counseling appears to hold particular promise for developing more effective approaches to counseling pre-adolescents in elementary school settings. The use of art in counseling pre-adolescent students appears to be particularly useful in two respects: first, it can provide a non-threatening means for counselors to approach the pre-adolescent child; secondly, the art products produced by the students can be used as non-threatening stimuli to elicit verbalizations about affective feelings.

Although the work of Arnheim (1966), Jourand (1962), Maslow (1962), and Rogers (1961, 1967) provides a rationale within which

the practice of art counseling can develop, the work of these men does not provide a systematic theory of the use of art in counseling. Some preliminary research with art counseling based on the work of these men has shown promising results. Vich and Rhyne (1967) have reported positive results using art materials with small groups of adults. Denny (1968) has reported positive results with his work utilizing art counseling with university students.

The research reported here was designed to extend empirical work in this newly emerging area. Two hypotheses were tested:

1. Pre-adolescent boys who receive a program of art counseling designed to develop a more positive self concept will show greater growth in positive self concept than boys who receive only a traditional non-directive counseling program designed to accomplish the same objective.
2. The results of the art counseling treatment will continue on into adolescence and thus will remain stable over relatively long periods of time.

METHOD

Subjects.

The subjects for this experiment were thirty boys who had just completed the sixth grade. Their average age was twelve years eight months. All the subjects were enrolled in the 1968 summer program of the North Carolina Advancement School.

Those boys who completed the summer program included 35 boys who had just finished the sixth and 36 boys who had just finished the fifth grade. The Advancement School is a residential school designed to conduct research on discrepant achievement. The school is maintained by the state and selects students from the public schools throughout the state. Only boys are selected. The school operates three terms per year--two semester terms and one summer term. The summer term lasts eight weeks.

Design and Procedure.

A pre-test, post-test, followup, single factor control group design was used for the study (Campbell & Stanley, 1963). The single factor had two levels--art counseling and traditional non-directive counseling. The pre-test was used as a covariate in the design.

All subjects enrolled in the summer term were required to take reading and mathematics. In addition, each subject could elect two activities from art, industrial arts, music, physical education, and science. The fifteen boys in the experimental group were all enrolled in art as one of their activities. The fifteen boys in the control group were enrolled in two activities other than art. Five boys not enrolled in art were randomly eliminated to obtain equal numbers in the experimental and control groups. To adjust for possible selection bias, the pre-test was used as a covariate. All students enrolled in the Advancement School for the summer term (N=71) participated in a testing

program during the first and last three days of the term. The pre-test and post-test measurements on the subjects in this study were obtained during these general testing sessions. This was designed to help eliminate the interactive effects of either the pre-test or the post-test (Campbell & Stanley, 1963). The follow-up testing was done fourteen months after the end of the summer term. The follow-up tests were administered in the local school by the local guidance counselor. Since the Advancement School regularly conducts systematic follow-up studies, the subjects for this study had no reason to believe that these follow-up tests were related to the art counseling project.

The measure of self concept was the Tennessee Self Concept Scale - TSC (Fitts, 1965). Ten of the sub-scales on the TSC were used in the analysis. The sub-scales used were: Total Positive, Identity, Self Satisfaction, Behavior, Physical Self, Moral-Ethical Self, Personal Self, Family Self, Social Self, and Self Criticism.

Treatment.

The art counseling group met for at least ninety minutes each day for five days a week during this eight weeks summer term. The subjects were unaware of the intended change in the criterion --self concept--that the treatment was designed to produce. The treatment was presented to the subjects as a visual arts course designed to aid them in better understanding both the world around them and themselves. There was no grading of the art products produced by the students and no grade was given for the

class. Grades are not given in any classes at the Advancement School.

The art teacher-counselor designed activities to aid the subjects in developing a more positive self concept through creative expressions and success oriented tasks. The art teacher-counselor was viewed by the subjects as primarily a teacher but the objectives and intent of the art teacher-counselor were counseling oriented in that the major goal was to change self concept. Each subject was encouraged to work with material with which he could be successful. Tasks were designed to be short term and easily completed in order to provide success experiences. The art teacher continuously emphasized that every person in the group was capable of contributing something unique, worthwhile, and useful. Self evaluation by each subject was stressed. Subjects were encouraged to question their motives and objectives in the production of a piece of art and to evaluate the product in relation to what they were trying to accomplish. The art teacher-counselor's primary objective in all these activities was to aid the development of self awareness. The majority of the art teacher-counselor's time during the class sessions was spent with individuals. The use of art to communicate, especially emotional communication, was stressed. Subjects were encouraged to verbalize about their art products with a view toward eliciting insightful statements about their feelings and self descriptions. The total approach approximated the position

of the self theorists and was designed to work toward open acceptance and expression of feelings (Rogers, 1967).

Both groups were exposed to the same residential summer school program which included the traditional non-directive counseling. The experimental and control group differed only in that the experimental group received art counseling. The regular program for all the subjects included the assignment of one counselor to fifteen boys. The counselor worked with these fifteen boys either individually or in small groups using traditional non-directive counseling practice. The counselor's objective was to help these boys develop a more positive self-concept. Some type of counseling --either individual or small group--was received every day by the boys. All the subjects were distributed over five different counselors.

Analysis.

A single factor multivariate analysis of covariance with ten criteria and ten covariates was performed on the data (Bock, 1960). Univariate analyses for each of the separate criteria with its respective covariate were also performed following the multivariate analysis. This analysis procedure initially treated the ten criteria as a single collection, in this case as a generalized measure of self concept. The principal advantage of such a multivariate procedure over the traditional separate univariate F tests is that it permits a test of the possible interactions among multiple criteria that cannot be evaluated if each criterion

variable is tested in isolation. The multivariate analysis performed here derived a set of coefficients that maximized between relative to within group variance. The result was then tested against a sampling distribution that took into account both the number of criteria and the fact that they had been weighted to produce a maximum effect. This, if fact, constituted a test of whether the groups could be significantly discriminated on the basis of this collection of variables (Cooley & Lohnes, 1962; Jones, 1966).

Results.

The means and standard deviations on each of the ten criteria for the art counseling group and the control group on the three testing occasions may be observed in Table 1.

Insert Table 1 about here

The major outcome of the experiment is readily apparent from a study of this table. Upon entering the Advancement School both groups obtained self concept scores in the low 40's and high 30's (based on standard score norms with $\bar{X}$ = 50, SD = 10). After the treatment, the art counseling group obtained self concept scores in the high 40's and low 50's, and these scores remained stable during the following fourteen months. The self concept scores of the control group remained essentially unchanged following the treatment period and remained relatively stable over the next

fourteen months. The typical gain for the art counseling group from pre-test to post-test was approximately ten points or one standard deviation.

The results of the statistical analysis of post-test scores to test the first hypothesis may be observed in Table 2.

Insert Table 2 about here

The multivariate discrimination was significant ($p < .02$, $df = 10,9$) and the size of the weightings indicate that several of the individual variables were important in making the overall discrimination. Five of the variables attained univariate significance ($p \leq .05$, $df = 1,18$). The art counseling group obtained higher adjusted post-test mean scores on total positive ($p < .03$), self satisfaction ($p < .005$), physical self ($p < .05$), personal self ($p < .02$), and social self ($p < .03$). Although identity, behavior, and family self did not attain univariate significance, the rather large weightings received by these variables indicate their importance in making the overall discrimination.

Table 3 presents the results of the statistical analysis used to test the second hypothesis.

Insert Table 3 about here

On the occasion of the followup fourteen months later, the multivariate discrimination approached significance ($p < .075$,

df=10,8). Although the ability to discriminate between these two groups on the basis of this collection of variables on this occasion was less precise, the discrimination was still in the predicted direction. On this occasion, three variables attained univariate significance ($p \leq .05$, df=1,17). The art counseling group obtained higher adjusted followup mean test scores on total positive ($p < .02$), personal self ($p < .02$), and social self ($p < .02$). Again the relatively large weightings received by other variables such as identity, self satisfaction, behavior, physical self, moral-ethical self, and family self indicated that they were important in making the overall discrimination.

Discussion.

The results of this study supported both hypotheses. Clearly, the immediate measured outcomes indicated that the art counseling approach was more effective in bringing about self concept changes among pre-adolescent boys than was the traditional non-directive counseling program. Furthermore, the changes in self concept observed in the experimental group remained remarkably stable over a fourteen month period which encompassed the transition into adolescence.

These results indicate the feasibility of a vigorous research program on variables relevant to this technique. This is especially appropriate for counseling programs designed for pre-adolescent students. Counseling with students in the context of the elementary school has encountered some difficult

counselor-client communication barriers. The use of art as a means of entering a meaningful counseling relationship with pre-adolescent students appears to hold considerable promise. The primary technique of the approach used in this research was the use of art as a means of providing conditions in which pre-adolescents feel free to verbalize their feelings and to think about themselves in the presence of adults.

The results of this study are especially significant when the nature of the control group is considered. Actually, the students in the control group received what might be considered an ideal counseling program. During the term in which this experiment was conducted, a full time counselor was assigned to fifteen boys. Every boy received some type of counseling every day. If students in the art counseling approach changed in self concept more than students who received only this regular counseling program, then its effectiveness relative to a more typical public school counseling program should be even more dramatic.

Table 1. Means and Standard Deviations for Experimental and Control Groups for Ten Criterion Variables on the Occasions of the Pre-Test, Post-Test, and Follow-Up

Variable	Art Counseling (N = 15)						Control (N = 15)					
	Pre-Test		Post-Test		Follow-Up		Pre-Test		Post-Test		Follow-Up	
	$\bar{X}$	SD	$\bar{X}$	SD	$\bar{X}$	SD	$\bar{X}$	SD	$\bar{X}$	SD	$\bar{X}$	SD
Total Positive	41.20	14.87	51.67	14.70	52.71	10.19	46.47	12.92	42.87	13.44	41.33	9.47
Identity	38.53	13.05	48.07	13.84	53.79	14.07	44.47	16.40	41.47	19.10	42.13	13.22
Self Satisfaction	46.47	15.50	58.86	15.46	49.36	11.27	48.87	12.31	44.53	11.71	42.07	8.56
Behavior	39.60	15.21	48.67	15.04	48.43	14.24	44.20	11.18	42.00	11.87	42.13	10.82
Physical Self	45.67	13.95	56.33	15.74	54.86	11.16	48.33	14.03	46.67	18.53	48.80	12.94
Moral-Ethical Self	37.37	15.14	46.93	14.72	42.21	14.26	39.67	12.76	41.27	8.84	39.53	10.91
Personal Self	44.27	15.96	57.40	15.23	53.29	11.77	51.27	12.84	47.00	17.28	45.40	8.68
Family Self	43.73	14.38	48.87	12.57	47.57	14.82	46.53	12.02	45.20	12.36	42.73	11.44
Social Self	39.40	12.91	48.93	14.31	54.07	13.83	43.00	11.86	40.47	8.70	42.13	7.42
Self Criticism	44.60	7.91	47.60	6.91	48.29	8.75	46.53	6.81	47.33	4.79	51.40	5.68

Note: One subject was not located for the art counseling group on the occasion of the follow-up; the N for the follow-up for the art counseling group was therefore 14.

Table 1. Means and Standard Deviations for Experimental and Control Groups for Ten Criterion Variables on the Occasions of the Pre-Test, Post-Test, and Follow-Up

Variable	Art Counseling (N = 15)						Control (N = 15)					
	Pre-Test		Post-Test		Follow-Up		Pre-Test		Post-Test		Follow-Up	
	$\bar{X}$	SD	$\bar{X}$	SD	$\bar{X}$	SD	$\bar{X}$	SD	$\bar{X}$	SD	$\bar{X}$	SD
Total Positive	41.20	14.87	51.67	14.70	52.71	10.19	46.47	12.92	42.87	13.44	41.33	9.47
Identity	38.53	13.05	48.07	13.84	53.79	14.07	44.47	16.40	41.47	19.10	42.13	13.22
Self Satisfaction	46.47	15.50	58.86	15.46	49.36	11.27	48.87	12.31	44.53	11.71	42.07	8.56
Behavior	39.60	15.21	48.67	15.04	48.43	14.24	44.20	11.18	42.00	11.87	42.13	10.82
Physical Self	45.67	13.95	56.33	15.74	54.86	11.16	48.33	14.03	46.67	18.53	48.80	12.94
Moral-Ethical Self	37.37	15.14	46.93	14.72	42.21	14.26	39.67	12.76	41.27	8.84	39.53	10.91
Personal Self	44.27	15.96	57.40	15.23	53.29	11.77	51.27	12.84	47.00	17.28	45.40	8.68
Family Self	43.73	14.38	48.87	12.57	47.57	14.82	46.53	12.02	45.20	12.36	42.73	11.44
Social Self	39.40	12.91	48.93	14.31	54.07	13.83	43.00	11.86	40.47	8.70	42.13	7.42
Self Criticism	44.60	7.91	47.60	6.91	48.29	8.75	46.53	6.81	47.33	4.79	51.40	5.68

Note: One subject was not located for the art counseling group on the occasion of the follow-up; the N for the follow-up for the art counseling group was therefore 14.

Table 2. Adjusted Post Test Means for the Experimental and Control Groups on the Ten Criterion Variables with the ANCOVA and Multiple Discriminate Analysis Results.

Variable	Adjusted Post Means Experimental	Control	F df-1, 18	P	Standardized Coefficient
Total Positive	53.33	41.20	6.28	.03	7.79
Identity	50.16	39.37	3.12	.10	1.08
Self Satisfaction	59.01	44.39	10.33	.005	0.81
Behavior	49.66	41.01	2.41	.14	-7.04
Physical Self	58.27	44.73	4.86	.05	-0.54
Moral-Ethical Self	46.92	41.28	1.42	.25	0.50
Personal Self	59.82	44.58	7.72	.02	-0.65
Family Self	50.55	43.52	2.01	.17	-3.43
Social Self	50.34	39.06	6.40	.03	1.50
Self Criticism	47.77	47.16	0.09	.76	0.05

Note: Multivariate Discriminate Analysis,
$F = 4.66$, $df = 10/9$, $p < .02$

Table 3. Adjusted Follow-Up Means for the Experimental and Control Groups on the Ten Criterion Variables with the ANCOVA and Multiple Discriminate Analysis Results.

Variable	Adjusted Post Means		F	P	Standardized
	Experimental	Control	df=1, 17		Coefficient
Total Positive	52.16	41.85	7.57	.02	-0.90
Identity	53.30	42.59	3.56	.08	-1.94
Self Satisfaction	49.42	42.00	3.87	.07	-1.54
Behavior	47.22	43.26	0.58	.46	-1.68
Physical Self	54.76	48.88	1.25	.28	1.84
Moral-Ethical Self	40.54	41.10	0.01	.92	2.68
Personal Self	54.23	44.52	8.02	.02	-0.20
Family Self	46.57	43.66	0.26	.62	1.48
Social Self	53.70	42.48	6.86	.02	0.36
Self Criticism	48.71	51.00	0.56	.46	0.31

Note: Multiple Discriminate Analysis, $F=2.86$, $df = 10/8$, $p < .075$

REFERENCES

Arnheim, R. Toward a psychology of art. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1966.

Aubrey, R. F. Misapplication of therapy models to school counseling. Personnel and Guidance Journal, 1969, 48, 273-278.

Aubrey, R. F. The legitimacy of elementary school counseling: some unresolved issues and conflicts. Personnel and Guidance Journal, 1967, 46, 355-359.

Bock R. D. Multivariate and univariate analysis of variance for any design. University of North Carolina, Psychometric Laboratory, Research Monograph No. 3, 1960.

Campbell, D. T. and Stanley, J. C. Experimental and quasi-experimental designs for research. Chicago: Rand McNally, 1963.

Cooley, W. W. and Lohnes, P. R. Multivariate procedures for the behavioral sciences. New York: Wiley, 1962.

Denny, J. M. Case study: Art therapy in the counseling of a university student. Bulletin of Art Therapy, 1968, 7, 94-99.

Dinkmeyer, D. Developmental counseling in the elementary school. Personnel and Guidance Journal, 1966, 45, 262-266

Fitts, W. H. Tennessee self concept scale. Nashville: Counselor Recordings and Tests, 1965.

Jones, L. V. Analysis of variance in its multivariate developments. In R. B. McCall (Ed.), Handbook of multivariate experimental psychology. Chicago: Rand McNally, 1966.

Jourand, S. M. The transparent self. Princeton: D. Van Nostrand, 1962.

Maslow, A. H. Toward a psychology of being. Princeton: D. Van Nostrand, 1962.

Rogers, C. R. On becoming a person. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1961.

References (Cont.)

Rogers, C. R. The process of the basic encounter group. In J.F.T. Bugental, Challenge of humanistic psychology. New York: McGraw - Hill, 1967.

Thoresen, C. E. Relevance and research in counseling. Review of Educational Research, 1969, 39, 263-281.

Vich, M. A. and Rhyne, J. Psychological growth and the use of art materials: small group experiments with adults. Journal of Humanistic Psychology, 1967, 7, 163-170.